WILLIAMSBURG ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES Tuesday, May 23, 2006

CALL TO ORDER AND ATTENDANCE

The regular semimonthly Architectural Review Board meeting was held on Tuesday, May 23, 2006, at 6:30 p.m. in the third Floor Conference Room of the Municipal Building.

Chairman Spence called the meeting to order. Present in addition to Mr. Spence were Board members Messrs. Edwards, Lane, Hertzler and Quarles. Board member Klee was absent. Staff members present were Zoning Administrator Murphy and Secretary Scott.

Consent Agenda

Chairman Spence explained the consent agenda procedure to the audience stating that if an application is in full compliance with the **Design Review Guidelines**, it is placed on the consent agenda. If no member of the Board has any question regarding the application and concurs that it is in full compliance with the *Guidelines*, the audience is asked if they are present to discuss any case on the Consent Agenda. If there is no one in the audience present to discuss any item on the Consent Agenda, those applications are approved as submitted and the applicants are then free to leave the meeting.

Applications on tonight's Consent Agenda:

ARB #06-052 Boone/705 College Terrace – Fence

ARB #06-053 Colonial Williamsburg Foundation/416 East Duke of Gloucester

Street – Access ramp for the Alexander Purdie Kitchen

SIGN #06-023 Days Inn/1900 Richmond Road – Monument Sign

SIGN #06-025 SAS Shoes/3044 Richmond Road – Building Mounted Sign

There being no additional question or comment from the Board or the audience about the Consent Agenda cases, Mr. Hertzler moved that they be approved. Mr. Quarles seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 5-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Spence, Hertzler, Quarles

Nav: None

Abstain: Hertzler (from 06-52), Spence and Edwards (from 06-53)

Absent: Klee

ARCHITECTURAL PRESERVATION DISTRICT

ARB #06-049 Colonial Penniman, LLC/Penniman Road & Page Street – New Timeshare Buildings. Conceptual Review

Chairman Spence noted that at the last ARB meeting the Board had asked Mr. Tingle to return with a few more design options for the seven new timeshare buildings. He added that in addition to these options, Mr. Tingle will be presenting proposed designs for an amenities building and a welcome center building.

Tom Tingle and Brad Sipes with Guernsey Tingle Architects, were present to respond to any questions or comments. Mr. Sipes presented the revised plans (four options) for the timeshare buildings as well as new plans for the welcome center and amenities building. He noted that the applicant is requesting comments from the Board on the revised design proposals, as well as the designs for the new buildings. Mr. Sipes said Board members Spence and Klee met with Mr. Tingle and himself to review and to further develop some of the ideas discussed at the last ARB meeting. He noted that although Mr. Klee is absent from the meeting tonight, he did email his comments to the members of the ARB.

The four options for a typical timeshare building follow: **Option A** simplifies the proposed original design; **Option B** uses low slope roofs and traditional parapet walls to tie the hip roof pavilions at the buildings ends with a hip roof pavilion at the center; **Option C** is a formal approach in a classic 5-part organization; and **Option D** is a much less formal approach, suggesting 4-story walkup residential units that have been added to and infilled over time. Roof projections are proposed to be used for housing mechanical equipment.

Mr. Sipes also presented the plans for the amenities building and welcome center building. The amenities building is brick and hardiplank construction, two stories, with sloped roofs, and uses typical Georgian proportions. The welcome center building, located at the corner of Penniman Road and Page Street, is one story high with sloped roofs, brick and hardiplank construction, and also uses typical Georgian proportions.

Mr. Hertzler remarked that it is obvious a lot of hard work was put into the designs and it is very much appreciated.

Chairman Spence opened the public hearing.

There being no comment from the audience the public hearing was closed.

After extensive discussion regarding the different proposed options, the Board heard presentations of the amenities building and the welcome center. Mr. Spence moved that **Option A Revised** be approved as the preferred conceptual design for the timeshare buildings, and that both the amenities building and the welcome center building be approved conceptually. The applicant is to return to the June 13 meeting with final plans.

Mr. Hertzler seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 5-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Spence, Hertzler, Quarles

Nay: None Absent: Klee

ARB #06-054 Colonial Penniman, LLC/331 Penniman Road – demolish one story single family dwelling and outbuildings (this is in conjunction with the timeshare proposal ARB #06-049). Approved.

The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing one-story dwelling and shed at 331 Penniman Road. The house is listed as being 50 years old or older having been constructed in 1940. It was noted that the buildings are not on the list of buildings located on or eligible for the National Register.

Mr. Edwards stated this is a nice sturdy house and asked if there are any options to its demolition. Mr. Tingle responded that it is brick and block and would be a real challenge to move. He suggested an option might be to recycle the materials and added that it has a slate roof.

Chairman Spence opened the public hearing.

Kyra Cook, 315 Penniman Road, stated that it is a sweet little house, affordable and currently rented.

There being no additional comment from the audience the public hearing was closed.

Mr. Spence moved that the demolition of the dwelling and shed be approved.

Mr. Lane seconded the motion.

Board discussion included comments that the house looks to be in good condition, but due to parking requirements, possible relocation is a difficult option.

The motion carried by roll call vote of 3-2.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Lane, Spence, Hertzler Nay: Quarles, Edwards

Absent: Klee

ARB #06-055

Colonial Penniman, LLC/115 Penniman Road – Demolish Colonial Capitol Inn and abandoned building at the southeast corner of Page Street and Penniman Road (this is in conjunction with the timeshare proposal ARB #06-049). Approved.

The applicant is proposing to demolish the Colonial Capital Inn at 115 Penniman Road, and the vacant building at the southeast corner of Page Street and Penniman Road. As with the previous case, the buildings are not on the list of buildings located on or eligible for the National Register. Mr. Tingle noted that the old plumbing supply building has been empty for many years, renovation is not feasible and this site is key to the proposed property development. Mr. Quarles stated that he sees no reason not to demolish these buildings.

Chairman Spence opened the public hearing.

There being no comment the public hearing was closed.

Mr. Spence moved that the demolition of the buildings be approved. Mr. Edwards seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 5-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Lane, Spence, Hertzler, Quarles, Edwards

Nay: None Absent: Klee

CORRIDOR PROTECTION DISTRICT

ARB #06-048 Holiday Inn Patriot/3032 Richmond Road – Exterior Change (remove mansard roof). Approved.

Paul White, Paul White & Associates, was present representing the applicant to remove the mansard roof on the building for replacement with an EFIS material matching Bracken Tenement Biscuit in color. The Board conceptually approved the plans on January 10, 2006 without an EFIS cornice line on the hotel rooms on the rear of the building. The applicant is requesting approval of Scheme A with the EFIS trim on the rear hotel rooms. Mr. Spence noted it seems like a reasonable request in terms of proportion and the amount of EFIS.

Mr. Hertzler moved that Scheme A with the EFIS trim on the rear hotel rooms be approved. Mr. Spence seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 5-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Spence, Hertzler, Quarles

Nay: None Absent: Klee

SIGNS

SIGN #06-024 Patriot Plaza/3042 Richmond Road – Monument Sign & Directory Signs – Approved.

Randy Dressler, Scotty's Signs, Inc., stated the proposed four directory signs have been removed from the request because they did not meet the sign regulations. A revised plan for one 10 square foot directory sign and one 2 square foot directional sign will be submitted for consideration at a later meeting.

The remaining application is for a 32 square foot monument sign for the shopping center. Proposed is an internally illuminated monument sign with colors from the Martin Senour Williamsburg palette: Stencil Square Blue background, white lettering, and China Closet Red for the cabinet. The base is proposed to be Tucker Pale Gray, which brings the number of colors to four. The *Guidelines* place a limit of three colors on a sign with any additional colors being considered on a case-by-case basis.

Chairman Spence opened the public hearing.

There being no comment from the audience the public hearing was closed.

There was discussion among Board members and Mr. Dressler regarding color options.

Mr. Lane moved that the proposed sign be approved with the condition that the sign base be either white or brick. Mr. Spence seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 5-0. Consensus among Board members is a preference for a brick base.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Spence, Hertzler, Quarles

Nay: None Absent: Klee

SIGN #06-026 Ripley's Believe It or Not Theater & Museum/1735 Richmond Road – Monument & Building Mounted Signs – Approved with Conditions

Jason Hill, Fine Signs and Graphics, presented the proposal. Discussion ensued regarding the color of the trim caps, the **4-D** with the sunburst symbol and the background color on the museum sign.

Mr. Spence moved that the proposed signage be approved with the following conditions:

- the **Ripley's** on the building mounted theater sign being 3M Deep Red;
- the **4-D** being in a straight line with the starburst being removed;
- the theater sign colors being 3M Vista Yellow with burgundy caps;
- the monument signs having a 3M Black Matte opaque background with 3M Deep Red and Vista Yellow lettering for the theater sign and 3M Black Matte opaque background with 3M Deep Red, Vista Yellow with white museum lettering for the museum sign.

Mr. Quarles seconded the motion which carried by roll call of 5-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Spence, Hertzler, Quarles

Nay: None Absent: Klee

OTHER

Minutes for May 9, 2006

The minutes for the May 9, 2006 meeting were approved viva voce as amended by Mr. Edwards.

Models

Mr. Hertzler noted that in the future 3-D models of large proposals, such as the timeshare project, would be helpful.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

Donna Dee Scott Secretary